

REVIEW 1

SUBMISSION: FTC-059

TITLE: Investigation of Wireless Communication from Under Seawater to Open Air with Xbee Pro

S2B Based on IEEE 802.15.4 (Case Study: West Java Pangandaran Offshore Indonesia)

AUTHORS: Nurul Hiron, Asep Andang, and Nundang Busaeri

Summary:

The paper aims to propose a solution so that Under seawater wireless communication by using

802.15.4 protocol and 2.4 GHz frequency is used to support the topology of Underwater Wireless

Sensor Network (UWSN).

Reviewer general recommendation:

Minor Revision.

Detailed Comments:

The paper is written in good English, can be understood clearly.

Organization:

ABSTRACT: I would suggest more details in the abstract, regarding Methods (number of participants,

explanation about WSN and wireless thecnologies). I think, it will be better if it is improved in

explaining the main problem and the method used and main result from test and measurment.

Introduction:

State the main problem clearly. Images are presented with color and text in easy-to-read images.

Citations should use the latest and most relevant sources. Avoid ambiguous writing and some

sentences need revision (see text with highligh):

1. Recommended to replace "The wireless technology builted to meet the people's

increasingly complex need" = "The wireless communication technology is built to meet the

people's increasingly complex needs"

2. Recommended to replace "The higher the water conductivity, become more the attenuation

of the wave radio" = "The higher the water con-ductivity, the higher the attenuation of the radio

wave"



- 3. Table 1 must changed as templete
- 4. Fig. 1. Picture quality need to be improved.
- 5. Fig. 2 Picture quality need to be improved
- 6. Fig. 5 Picture quality need to be improved
- 7. Table 2 must changed as templete
- 8. Conclusion must present the test results in a concrete manner and be conveyed clearly and briefly.
- 9. Reference list should use the latest relevant sources

REVIEW 2

SUBMISSION: FTC-059

TITLE: Investigation of Wireless Communication from Under Seawater to Open Air with Xbee Pro

S2B Based on IEEE 802.15.4 (Case Study: West Java Pangandaran Offshore Indonesia)

AUTHORS: Nurul Hiron, Asep Andang, and Nundang Busaeri

Summary:

This article is interesting, because it rarely discusses WSN in underwater communication by using

802.15.4 protocol and 2.4 GHz, plus in this article the focus of communication is carried out in very

salty seas and high corrosion risks.

Reviewer general recommendation:

Minor Revision.

Detailed Comments:

The paper is a unique idea, even though it needs proofreading, several tables must also be presented

according to the template suggested.

Organization:

ABSTRACT:

The abstract is accepted with the consideration that it is written quite well, easy to understand,

contains the main problems, methods and results. And the number of words is in accordance with the

provisions of the template.

INTRODUCTION:

Accepted with minor revision.

I think, in papers, the novelty is always very important to be defined very clearly. One way to highlight

the novelty comes from very critical analysis of the previous works. I am still thinking the introduction

needs to be improved. It's alright to briefly explain the previous works and what they concluded. Now,

if you take one step forward and try to show how studies tried to cover the gaps and they were

complement of each other, in that way you will end up with a better flow of introduction and finally

you can highlight the gap and novelty more clearly

Future Technologies Conference (FTC) 2018. 13-14 November 2018. Vancouver, BC, Canada



				_	
ΝЛ		ГL	-	· 🔼	
М	Г	ΙГ	11.	"	-

Accepted with no revision

RESULT:

Accepted with no revision

Some paragraphs need improvement. The Table 1 and Table 2 should be presented in accordance with the template, Fig. 1, Fig. 2, Fig. 6, Fig. 7, and Fig. 11. It must be presented in good quality. Suggestions, use the PNG or JPG format with high resolution.

CONCLUSION:

Accepted with no revision